Review of "Reconstructing Ashkenaz: e Human Face of Franco-German Jewry, 1000–1250", by David Malkiel

Magda Teter
Wesleyan University, mteter@fordham.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://wesscholar.wesleyan.edu/histfacpub

Recommended Citation
Teter, Magda, "Review of "Reconstructing Ashkenaz: e Human Face of Franco-German Jewry, 1000–1250", by David Malkiel" (2012). Faculty Scholarship. 44.
https://wesscholar.wesleyan.edu/histfacpub/44

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the History at WesScholar. It has been accepted for inclusion in Faculty Scholarship by an authorized administrator of WesScholar. For more information, please contact anelson01@wesleyan.edu, jmlozanowski@wesleyan.edu.
St. Clare Expelling the Saracens from Assisi: Religious Confrontation in Word and Image

NIRIT BEN-ARYEH DEBBY .......................................................... 643

Before the Right to Remain Silent: The Examinations of Anne Askew and Elizabeth Young

PENELIPE GENG ................................................................. 667

“Those sanctified places where our Saviour's feet had trode”: Jerusalem in Early Modern English Travel Narratives

BEATRICE GROVES ............................................................. 681

New Light on Antiparacelsianism (c. 1570–1610): The Medical Republic of Letters and the Idea of Progress in Science

TILMANN WALTER ............................................................. 701

The Case of Thomas Gataker: Confronting Superstition in Seventeenth-Century England

DIANE WILLEN ............................................................... 727

BOOK NOTICES ................................................................. 750

BOOKS REVIEWED IN THIS ISSUE ............................................. 754

BOOK REVIEWS ................................................................. 763
Manuscript Proposals

Contributions to The Sixteenth Century Journal are invited. We review in a double-blind, anonymous system. To facilitate this, we ask that you remove any identifying markers from the manuscript (including hidden text). Manuscripts should be submitted online at http://www.editorialmanager.com/tscj. Email inquiries can be made to dwhitford@united.edu. Documentation MUST follow Chicago Manual of Style, 16th ed. (2010), chap. 14, esp. secs. 14.14–18.

Books for Review and Submission of Book Reviews

Books for review should be sent to Gary Gibbs, SCJ Book Review Office, Department of History, Roanoke College, 221 College Lane, Salem, VA 24153-3794 USA. All books received will be listed in The Sixteenth Century Journal. Reviewers may contact the book review office at scj@roanoke.edu. Reviews should be sent via email; paper copies will be required only if requested. Reviewers will receive proofs via email approximately 12 weeks from the date of submission. Reviewers and publishers will receive offprints of their reviews.

Advertising Rates

For information and rate card contact Kathryn Brammall, Managing Editor, The Sixteenth Century Journal, Truman State University, 100 E. Normal Ave., Kirksville, MO 63501-4221 USA. Voice: 660-785-4665; fax: 660-785-4480; email: brammall@truman.edu.

Copyright and Permissions

Copyright © 2012 by Sixteenth Century Journal Publishers, Inc., Kirksville, Missouri. All rights reserved. For permission to photocopy or use material electronically from The Sixteenth Century Journal (ISSN 0361–0160), please access www.copyright.com or contact Copyright Clearance Center, Inc. (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, 978-750-8400. CCC is a not-for-profit organization that provides licenses and registration for a variety of users. It is our policy to require assignment of copyright from all contributors.

The Sixteenth Century Journal (ISSN 0361-0160) is published quarterly (April, July, October, January). Subscription rates: $75.00 per year for individuals inside the USA and $85.00 per year for those outside the USA; retirees and students (with copy of ID card): $45.00. Individual subscriptions include $20.00 for annual membership in SCSC. Institutions inside the USA pay $85.00, and those outside the USA pay $115.00. Periodical postage paid at Kirksville, MO 63501. Address all correspondence and changes of address to Sixteenth Century Journal Publishers, Inc., Truman State University, 100 E. Normal Ave., Kirksville, MO 63501-4221 USA. Fax: 660-785-4480. Email: brammall@truman.edu. Web site: http://escj.truman.edu. Subscriptions begin in April. The Sixteenth Century Journal is a member of the Conference of Historical Journals (CHJ).


Body text is set in Adobe’s Minion Pro. Cover display type, ITC Korinna Extra Bold. Printed by Thomson-Shore, Dexter, MI, USA.


Sixteenth Century Society and Conference Member, American Council of Learned Societies (ACLS)

www.sixteenthcentury.org

SCSC COUNCIL: President: Randall Zachman • Vice President/President-Elect: Sheila ffolliott • Endowment Chair: Raymond Mentzer • Past President: Cathy Yandell • Executive Director: Donald Harreld • Financial Officer: Eric Nelson • Class of 2014: Bruce Janacek • Thomas F. Mayer • Mihoko Suzuki • Class of 2013: Dora Polacheck, Diane Wolfthal, Randolph Head, Heinz Schott • Class of 2012: Kathryn Edwards, Emidio Campi, Sheila ffolliott, Allison Weber
Books Reviewed in This Issue

Reviewed by: Thomas Herron .................................................. 763

Walsingham and the English Imagination. Gary Waller
Reviewed by: Gordon Alley-Young .................................... 764

The Ideas of Man and Woman in Renaissance France: Print, Rhetoric, and Law. Lyndan Warner
Reviewed by: Carolyn Corretti ............................................. 766

Women’s Wealth and Women’s Writing in Early Modern England: “Little Legacies” and the Materials of Motherhood. Elizabeth Mazzola
Reviewed by: Andrea Janelle Dickens ................................. 768

Reviewed by: Konrad Eisenbichler ...................................... 769

The Religious Culture of Marian England. David Loades
Reviewed by: David H. Kennett ............................................. 771

Reviewed by: Katrina Olds ...................................................... 772

De cognitionibus quas habent daemones liber unus. Federico Borromeo.
Ed. and trans. Francesco di Ciaccia
Reviewed by: David Porreca .................................................... 774

Servants of Satan and Masters of Demons: The Spanish Inquisition’s Trials for Superstition, Valencia and Barcelona, 1478–1700. Gunnar W. Knutsen
Reviewed by: Wendy J. Turner .............................................. 776

Early Modern Religious Communities in East Central Europe: Ethnic Diversity, Denominational Plurality, and Corporative Politics in the Principality of Transylvania (1526–1671). István Keul
Reviewed by: D. C. Andersson ................................................. 777

Lutheran Humanists and Greek Antiquity: Melanchthonian Scholarship between Universal History and Pedagogy. Asaph Ben-Tov
Reviewed by: Lesley-Anne Dyer ............................................... 779

A Companion to Pastoral Care in the Late Middle Ages (1200–1500). Ed. Ronald J. Stansbury
Reviewed by: Gary W. Jenkins ............................................... 781

Double Agents: Cultural and Political Brokerage in Early Modern Europe. Marika Keblusek and Badeloch Vera Noldus
Reviewed by: Tracey A. Sowerby ............................................ 782

Alfonso X, the Learned: A Biography. H. Salvador Martínez. Trans. Odile Cisneros
Reviewed by: R. N. Swanson ............................................... 784

Reviewed by: Mirjam van Veen ........................................ 785

Trading Places: The Netherlandish Merchants in Early Modern Venice. Maartje van Gelder

Reviewed by: Jennifer L. Welsh ................................... 786

The Last Witch of Langenburg: Murder in a German Village. Thomas Robisheaux

The Hammer of Witches: A Complete Translation of the Malleus Maleficarum. Christopher S. Mackay

Reviewed by: Whitney A. M. Leeson .................................. 788

The Virgin Mary in Late Medieval and Early Modern English Literature and Popular Culture. Gary Waller

Reviewed by: Salvador Ryan ........................................ 790


Reviewed by: Ethan H. Shagan ......................................... 791

The Cambridge Introduction to Shakespeare’s Poetry. Michael Schoenfeldt

Reviewed by: Patricia Wareh ......................................... 793

Jousting in Medieval and Renaissance Iberia. Noel Fallows

Reviewed by: Donald J. Kagay ........................................ 794

Savonarola and Savonarolism. Stefano Dall’Aglio. Trans. John Gagné

Reviewed by: Gary W. Jenkins ........................................ 796

The Lavish Lovers. Molière. Trans. David Edney

Reviewed by: Joan E. McRae ........................................ 797


Reviewed by: James H. Dahlinger, SJ ................................ 799

Errance et cohérence: Essai sur la littérature transfrontalière à la Renaissance. Phillip John Usher

Reviewed by: Ayesha Ramachandran .................................. 800

The Fabulous Imagination: On Montaigne’s Essays. Lawrence D. Kritzman

Reviewed by: Elisabeth Hodges ...................................... 802

La Violence: Regards croisés sur une réalité plurielle. Ed. Lucien Faggion and Christophe Regina

Reviewed by: Martine Sauret .......................................... 803


Reviewed by: Lowell Duckert ........................................ 805
Broken Harmony: Shakespeare and the Politics of Music.
Joseph M. Ortiz
REVIEWED BY: Bradford Lee Eden ........................................... 806

Royal Poetrie: Monarchic Verse and the Political Imaginary of Early Modern England. Peter C. Herman
REVIEWED BY: Melissa Siik .......................................................... 808

REVIEWED BY: James H. Dahlinger, SJ ........................................... 809

Ed. Madhavi Menon
REVIEWED BY: Michael Cramer .................................................... 810

Du bien commun au mal nécessaire: Tyrannies, assassinats politiques et souveraineté en Italie, vers 1470-vers 1600. Renaud Villard
REVIEWED BY: Lidia Lanza ............................................................. 812

REVIEWED BY: Zinaida Chekantseva ............................................ 813

Thinking with the Church: Essays in Historical Theology. B. A. Gerrish
REVIEWED BY: Nancy van Deusen ............................................... 815

REVIEWED BY: Katherine L. French .............................................. 816

Art without an Author: Vasari’s Lives and Michelangelo’s Death.
Marco Ruffini
REVIEWED BY: Martha Dunkelman .............................................. 818

Il ritratto del vero governo del Prencipe (1552). Lucio Paolo Rosello
REVIEWED BY: Paul F. Grendler .................................................. 819

Lex und Ius: Beiträge zur Begründung des Rechts in der Philosophie des Mittelalters und der Frühen Neuzeit. Ed. Alexander Fidora, Matthias Lutzbachmann, and Andreas Wagner
REVIEWED BY: Thomas E. Morrissey .......................................... 821

Ed. Matthias Dall’Asta et al
REVIEWED BY: Timothy J. Wengert ............................................. 823

Symbols of Power in Art. Paola Rapelli
REVIEWED BY: Christine Corretti .............................................. 824

Sacred Possessions: Collecting Italian Religious Art, 1500–1900.
Ed. Gail Feigenbaum and Sybille Ebert-Schifferer
REVIEWED BY: Annemarie Sawkins ........................................... 825

Der Reichsvizekanzler Georg Sigmund Seld im Dienst der Kaiser Karl V. und Ferdinand I. Ernst Laubach
REVIEWED BY: Sean F. Dunwoody .............................................. 827
Books Reviewed

The Thirty Years War: A Documentary History. Ed. and trans. Tryntje Helfferich
Reviewed by: Martin W. Walsh ......................................................... 828

Die Cosmographiae Introductio Matthias Ringmanns und die Weltkarte Martin Waldseemülers aus dem Jahre 1507: Ein Meilenstein frühneuzeitlicher Kartographie. Martin Lehmann
Reviewed by: David J. Collins ......................................................... 829

Enfances Regnier, Chanson de geste du XIIIe siècle.
Ed. Delphine Dalens-Marekovic
Reviewed by: James H. Dahlinger, SJ ............................................. 830

Zoologische Einblattdrucke und Flugschriften vor 1800. Vol. 6, Supplement. Ingrid Faust, with the assistance of Klaus Bartelmeß and Klaus Stopp
Reviewed by: John Roger Paas ......................................................... 831

The Textuality and Materiality of Reading in Early Modern England.
Ed. Jennifer Richards and Fred Schurink
Reviewed by: Nathan James Martin ................................................. 832

Sumario de la Natural Historia de las Indias. Gonzalo Fernández de Oviedo. Ed. Álvaro Baraibar
Reviewed by: Anna Reid ................................................................. 834

Renegade Women: Gender, Identity, and Boundaries in the Early Modern Mediterranean. Eric R. Dursteler
Reviewed by: Ambereen Dadabhoy .................................................. 835

Reconfiguring the World: Nature, God, and Human Understanding from the Middle Ages to Early Modern Europe. Margaret J. Osler
Reviewed by: Gary W. Jenkins ......................................................... 837

Vedere con gli occhi del cuore: Alle origini del potere delle immagini.
Ottavia Niccoli
Reviewed by: Anne Jacobson Schutte ............................................. 839

Raised to Rule: Education Royalty at the Court of the Spanish Habsburgs, 1601–1634. Martha K. Hoffman
Reviewed by: Samuel A. Claussen .................................................. 840

Apelles am Fürstenhof: Facetten der Hofkunst um 1500 im Alten Reich. Ed. Matthias Müller, Klaus Weschenfelder, Beate Böckem, and Ruth Hansmann
Reviewed by: Heather Madar ......................................................... 842

Pageantry and Power: A Cultural History of the Early Modern Lord Mayor’s Show 1585–1639. Tracey Hill
Reviewed by: Laura Branch ............................................................ 843

The Monstrosity of Christ: Paradox or Dialectic? Slavoj Žižek and John Milbank
Ed. Creston Davis
Reviewed by: Lesley J. Pattinson .................................................... 845

Paracelsus und die Bilder: Über Glauben, Magie und Astrologie im Reformationszeitalter. Karl Mőseneder
Reviewed by: Sergiusz Michalski ..................................................... 847
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Reviewer</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>La carità e l’eros: Il matrimonio, la Chiesa, i suoi giudici nella Venezia del Rinascimento (1420–1545).</td>
<td>Ed. and trans. Meriel Connor</td>
<td>850</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spätrenaissance-Philosophie in Deutschland, 1570–1650: Entwürfe zwischen Humanismus und Konfessionalisierung, okkulten Traditionen und Schulmetaphysik.</td>
<td>Ed. Martin Mulsow</td>
<td>851</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pedro Moya de Contreras: Catholic Reform and Royal Power in New Spain, 1571–1591, 2nd ed.</td>
<td>Staff Poole</td>
<td>853</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Castiglion Fiorentino fra XIII e XV secolo: Politica, economia e società di un centro minore toscano.</td>
<td>Ed. Joachim Bahlcke, Wojciech Mrozowicz, Karen Lambrecht, Petr Mat’a, and Marian Ptak</td>
<td>858</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shakespeare and Biography.</td>
<td>Ed. Joachim Bahlcke, Wojciech Mrozowicz, Karen Lambrecht, Petr Mat’a, and Marian Ptak</td>
<td>861</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Foreign Relations of Elizabeth I.</td>
<td>Ed. Joachim Bahlcke, Wojciech Mrozowicz, Karen Lambrecht, Petr Mat’a, and Marian Ptak</td>
<td>862</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Foreign Relations of Elizabeth I.</td>
<td>Ed. Joachim Bahlcke, Wojciech Mrozowicz, Karen Lambrecht, Petr Mat’a, and Marian Ptak</td>
<td>864</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Notes:**
- Reviews are from Sixteenth Century Journal, XLIII/3 (2012).
Books Reviewed

Vision and the Visionary in Raphael. Christian K. Kleinbub
Reviewed by: Linda A. Koch ........................................... 870

Reviewed by: Linde M. Brocato .................................. 871

Monstrous Births and Visual Culture in Sixteenth-Century Germany.
Jennifer Spinks
Reviewed by: Pernille Arenfeldt .................................. 873

Paracelsus’s Theory of Embodiment: Conception and Gestation in Early Modern Europe. Amy Eisen Cislo
Reviewed by: Anna Corrias ....................................... 874

Sacred History and National Identity. Jason Nice
Reviewed by: Katharine K. Olson ................................. 876

Reviewed by: Jacob Selwood ....................................... 879

Essays on Giordano Bruno. Hilary Gatti
Reviewed by: David Porreca ....................................... 881

Conquest, Tribute, and Trade: The Quest for Precious Metals and the Birth of Globalization. Howard J. Erlichman
Reviewed by: Roger Louis Martínez-Dávila ....................... 882

Stealing the Mystic Lamb: The True Story of the World’s Most Coveted Masterpiece.
Noah Charney
Reviewed by: Maria Snyder ........................................ 884

Hermann Bote: Braunschweiger Stadtschreiber und Literat: Studien zu seinem Leben und Werk. Herbert Blume
Reviewed by: Albrecht Classen .................................... 885

La coexistence confessionnelle à l’épreuve: Études sur les relations entre protestants et catholiques dans la France moderne. Ed. Didier Boisson and Yves Krumenacke
Reviewed by: Brian Sandberg ..................................... 886

Moral Play and Counterpublic: Transformations in Moral Drama, 1465–1599.
Ineke Murakami
Reviewed by: David Kathman ..................................... 887

Transformations of Memory and Forgetting in Sixteenth-Century France: Marguerite de Navarre, Pierre de Ronsard, Michel de Montaigne.
Nicolas Russell
Reviewed by: Ezra L. Plank ......................................... 889

Patristic Tradition and Intellectual Paradigms in the 17th Century.
Ed. Silke-Petra Bergain and Karla Pollmann
Reviewed by: Lawrence E. Frizzell ............................... 890
Das Wormser Schisma der Augsburger Konfessionsverwandten von 1557: Protestantische Konfessionspolitik und Theologie im Zusammenhang des zweiten Wormser Religionsgesprächs. Björn Slenczka

Reviewed by: Christian D. von Dehsen .................................................. 892

Correspondance du cardinal Jean du Bellay, vol. 4. Rémy Scheurer, Loris Petris, and David Amherdt

Reviewed by: Phillip John Usher ............................................................. 893


Reviewed by: Michael Wolfe ................................................................. 895

English Presbyterianism: 1590–1640. Polly Ha

Reviewed by: Ryan M. Reeves ............................................................... 896

Reconstructing Ashkenaz: The Human Face of Franco-German Jewry, 1000–1250. David Malkiel

Reviewed by: Magda Teter ................................................................. 898

The Bible in the Literary Imagination of the Spanish Golden Age: Images and Texts from Columbus to Velázquez. Terence O’Reilly

Reviewed by: Jessica A. Boon .............................................................. 899

The Visions of Isobel Gowdie: Magic, Witchcraft and Dark Shamanism in Seventeenth-Century Scotland. Emma Wilby

Reviewed by: Janay Nugent ................................................................. 901

Images of Leprosy: Disease, Religion, and Politics in European Art. Christine M. Boeckl

Reviewed by: Larissa Tracy ................................................................. 902

Historia de la nueva Mexico. Gaspar de Villagrá. Ed. Manuel M. Martín Rodríguez

Reviewed by: Michael Vargas ............................................................. 904

The Copernican Question: Prognostication, Skepticism, and Celestial Order. Robert S. Westman

Reviewed by: Thomas F. Mayer .......................................................... 905


Reviewed by: Jerold C. Frakes ............................................................. 907

Figurations of France: Literary Nation-Building in Times of Crisis (1550–1650). Marcus Keller

Reviewed by: Erin Glunt ................................................................. 908


Reviewed by: Faith S. Harden ............................................................. 910


Reviewed by: Pauline Reid ................................................................. 911
Alister Chapman, John Coffey, and Brad S. Gregory
Reviewed by: Jacqueline Rose ................................................................. 913

Lori Ann Garner
Reviewed by: Emma J. Wells ................................................................. 914

Out of Sorts: On Typography and Print Culture. Joseph A. Dane
Reviewed by: Eric J. Johnson ................................................................. 916

Fallible Authors: Chaucer’s Pardoner and Wife of Bath. Alastair Minnis
Reviewed by: Larissa Tracy ................................................................. 918

Witchcraft and Magic in the Nordic Middle Ages. Stephen A. Mitchell
Reviewed by: Jeffrey R. Watt ................................................................. 919

Collected Works of Erasmus: Controversies. Ed. James D. Tracy and
Manfred Hoffman
Reviewed by: Andrew A. Chibi ............................................................... 921

The Poetry of Place: Lyric, Landscape, and Ideology in Renaissance France.
Louisa Mackenzie
Reviewed by: Kendall B. Tarte ............................................................... 923

Generation als Grundbegriff einer historischen Geschichtskultur: Die Nürnberger
Tucher im langen 16. Jahrhundert. Christian Kuhn
Reviewed by: Albrecht Classen ............................................................... 924

Cécile Cassy-Vincent
Reviewed by: Lesley J. Pattinson ........................................................... 926

Lady Jane Grey: A Tudor Mystery. Eric Ives
Reviewed by: Dorothy Potter ................................................................. 927

Protestants: A History from Wittenberg to Pennsylvania 1517–1740.
C. Scott Dixon
Reviewed by: Kirsi Stjerna ................................................................. 929

Rembrandt and the Face of Jesus. Ed. Lloyd DeWitt
Reviewed by: Sara Nair James ............................................................... 930

The Book in the Renaissance. Andrew Pettegree
Reviewed by: Eric J. Johnson ................................................................. 932

Altered and Adorned: Using Renaissance Prints in Daily Life. Suzanne Karr
Schmidt and Kimberly Nichols
Reviewed by: Jonathan Rinck ............................................................... 933

L’assassinio del Duca: Esilio e morte di Lorenzino de’ Medici. Stefano Dall’Aglio
Reviewed by: Irene Fosi ................................................................. 935

Metaphor and Shakespearean Drama: Unchaste Signification.
Maria Franziska Fahey
Reviewed by: Drew J. Scheler ............................................................... 936
The Seven Deadly Sins. Ed. Richard Newhauser  
**Reviewed by:** J. Patrick Hornbeck II ........................................ 938

*Death and a Maiden: Infanticide and the Tragical History of Grethe Schmidt.*  
William David Myers  
**Reviewed by:** Susan C. Karant-Nunn ........................................ 940

*Catholic Particularity in Seventeenth-Century French Writing.* Richard Parish  
**Reviewed by:** Christopher J. Lane ........................................ 941

*Classical Myths in Italian Renaissance Painting.* Luba Freedman  
**Reviewed by:** Shelley E. Zuraw ........................................ 943

*Re-Thinking Renaissance Objects.* Ed. Peta Motture and Michelle O’Malley  
**Reviewed by:** K. Michelle Arthur ........................................ 944

*Karlstadt and the Origins of the Eucharistic Controversy.* Amy Nelson Burnett  
**Reviewed by:** C. Scott Dixon ........................................ 946

*Calvin & His Influence, 1509–2009.* Ed. Irena Backus and Philip Benedict  
**Reviewed by:** Jon Balserak ........................................ 947

**Reviewed by:** Edmund P. Cueva ........................................ 949

*L’amitié entre princes.* Bertrand Haan  
**Reviewed by:** Brian Moots ........................................ 950

*Ptolemy’s Geography in the Renaissance.* Ed. Zur Shalev and Charles Burnett  
**Reviewed by:** Mark Rosen ........................................ 952

*Negotiating the Jacobean Book.* Ed. Pete Langman  
**Reviewed by:** Laura Endicott ........................................ 954

*Historical Interpretations of the “Fifth Empire.”* Maria Ana Travassos Valdez  
**Reviewed by:** Lawrence E. Frizzell ........................................ 955

*Medicaea Medaeae.* Luisa Capodiedi  
**Reviewed by:** Marian Rothstein ........................................ 957

*Persecution, Plague, and Fire.* Ellen MacKay  
**Reviewed by:** Colleen E. Kennedy ........................................ 958

Reviewed by: Magda Teter, Wesleyan University

Davil Malkiel’s *Reconstructing Ashkenaz* seeks to challenge the prevalent perception of sharp cultural divisions between Jews of northern Europe, or “Ashkenaz,” and Jews of the Mediterranean world, mostly the Iberian Peninsula, or “Sefarad.” To argue that the divisions were not as stark, Malkiel focuses on several themes: martyrdom, obedience to rabbinic authority, and interactions with non-Jews. The traditional, though now increasingly challenged understanding of the culture of Jews in northern Europe in the medieval and later periods has stressed their insularity, piety, and readiness for martyrdom. Sephardic Jews, on the other hand, were considered culturally more open to outside influences, balancing their “Jewishness” with their engagement in non-Jewish culture, sometimes transgressing religious precepts and disobeying rabbinic authority. This dichotomous representation of medieval Ashkenazic and Sephardic Jews has its roots in the modern period, when Jews in Germany and other northern European countries began to look for ways to integrate, culturally and politically, into the emerging modern states. By the late eighteenth and the nineteenth centuries, differences between Ashkenazic and Sephardic Jews were indeed starker, and their experience of modernity different, in part because of each group’s experience of the past.

There is no doubt that there are differences, sometimes even quite acute, between the cultures of Ashkenazi and Sephardic Jews, but Malkiel is right that these distinctions may have been exaggerated and misunderstood by historians. The book seeks to challenge the myth of Ashkenazi isolation and communal autonomy, and present Ashkenazi Jews as much more textured historical actors, actively participating in the social and cultural developments of the larger society in which they lived. The differences, Malkiel argues, are much softer than has been accepted until recently. The premise of the book is, thus, important, the execution, however, more disappointing.

The book’s important contributions are often lost in long-winded discussions of scholarly debates that contain numerous quotes and details, too internal and specific to Jewish historiography that may leave scholars not familiar with all the characters—who are often not introduced, except in shorthand by their last names—lost. At one point, the author admits in passing, “The object of our study turns out to be the historians as much as or more than subjects of their investigation” (72). Although it is important to discuss historiography to correct our understanding of history, such corrections cannot be made effectively without telling the history through primary sources. Yet, primary sources in this book seem like a prop used to score historiographic points rather than tell the (corrected) story. The book and its historiographic impact would have been stronger if the balance were reversed and the story were told through the sources, allowing the author to highlight problems within historiography. As is, however, the debates with historians take precedence over telling history; quotes from historians predominate, obscuring the “human face” of the book’s medieval subjects. And so, for a book that seeks to tell the story of medieval Ashkenazic Jews anew there is not enough storytelling. For example, discussing “apostasy” (itself a loaded term), the author challenges earlier historians’ apologetic approach to Jewish conversions to Christianity, arguing that the “apostasy” was a more common phenomenon; but again, primary sources supporting this important statement are nearly missing. Rabbenu Tam,
a medieval Jewish leader, is cited, and one paragraph is devoted to “the volume of legal sources about the apostate’s right to inherit.” It seems that a more effective challenge to earlier historians would have been inclusion of the stories of these converts and a detailed discussion of primary sources supporting the author’s claims (118–21, 138.) Because of this focus on minute points within internal debates in Jewish historiography, sometimes in a tone that reads unnecessarily as attacks on other historians, the book often appears as if it were a fruit of discussions in a graduate seminar on medieval Jewish history.

Historiographic books, of course, have an important place in scholarship. The best ones take works of historians and locate them in historical contexts of the authors’ lives. Reconstructing Ashkenaz is a hybrid; it wants to be a book about medieval Jewish history and a historiographic critique of earlier historians’ works. Being so, the book does not accomplish most effectively what either more narrative, if still revisionist historical or historiographic works could accomplish separately. (Some of the problems with the book could have been perhaps remedied in the editorial process.) Although the book addresses an important subject of stereotypes in representing Jews of “Ashkenaz” and “Sefarad” that had been skewed by decades of sometimes ideologically motivated studies and although the book does reach valuable conclusions, its format—far too insular for a broader, even scholarly, audience—will limit the book’s appeal as a possible text to be adopted in classrooms and thereby its potentially broader impact.


Reviewed by: Jessica A. Boon, University of North Carolina–Chapel Hill

The field of biblical reception history emphasizes interdisciplinary work between biblical studies and the history of Christian thought and practice, yet usually configures its field of inquiry around the Bible as a whole or around individual books of the Bible. As a result, it leaves aside the multiple and rich arenas of literature, art, and drama that in certain eras depended on a cultural framework imbued with biblical language and stories. O’Reilly, a scholar of Spanish Golden Age religion and the arts, articulates in his book what can be termed a new method of biblical reception history; he acknowledges the different levels—latinate and vernacular—of biblical literacy that authors and audiences held in common and posits that no intellectual history of any piece of literature or art in the early modern era is complete without attention to its biblical sources. Of particular interest is his insight that an author’s allusions to the Bible may not always have been intentional, but can nevertheless be tracked to a common trope initially disseminated by devotional literature as well as by theologians and biblical exegetes. O’Reilly thus argues in part that no type of literature or art in the Golden Age can be fully analyzed without crossing disciplinary boundaries, for religious literature generated components critical to various types of apparently secular works. As he states in the introduction: “Normally [biblical images] function as part of the matrix of symbols and myths by which Golden Age Spaniards interpreted the world in which they lived.” Yet he does not consider only putatively secular works, but also religious art and texts whose biblical framework has so far escaped scholarly notice.

The six chapters of the book contain six case studies—travelogues, devotional guides, picaresque fiction, religious poetry, drama, and painting—all of which he suggests are